

An Introduction Of Islamic Concept Of State And Non-Islamic Concept Of State: A Comparative Study

Muhammad Manzar Ehsan¹, Hafiz Hussnain Khaliq², Hafiz Muhammad Aslam Khan³, Hafiz Zakirullah⁴, Sumara Perveen⁵

¹(Assistant Prof. Department of Islamic Studies, The University Of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan)

²(Lecturer, Department of Islamic Studies, The University Of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan)

³(Assistant Prof., Department of Islamic Studies, The University Of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan)

⁴(Lecturer, Department of Islamic Studies, The University Of Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan)

⁵(Ph.D Scholar .Department of Islamic Studies, Minhaj University Lahore, Lahore, Pakistan)

Abstract

In an Islamic state, the leader is obliged by the Quran to run the affairs of the people using ‘Shura’ (consultation). He is elected based upon confidence to lead, not on his policies, because he is obliged to derive laws based upon the Quran and Sunnah ‘and has no option to not implement the clear laws contained therein, even if not convenient for govt., which provides full protections for people’s rights at all times. In a (Western) secular Democracy, the leaders are not obliged to consult the people in running the affairs (nor fulfill their promises). They derive laws from what is convenient, and may (and do) take away people’s rights using that justification. In Islam, the leader remains in power until he becomes unjust or incompetent. In a (Western) secular Democracy, the leader remains in power despite being unjust or incompetent, and may get elected again if he can lie to the people to persuade them he is the lesser of two evils. An Islamic State is based upon sovereignty to the Creator, who does not change his mind, it not prone to prejudice, bigotry or ignorance. A (Western) secular Democracy is based upon sovereignty of the Individual, who does change their mind, is prone to prejudice, bigotry and ignorance. This article explains deeply about Comparison of Islamic concept of state and non-Islamic Idea of State.

Keyword: State, Democracy, Idea of State, comparative study

State concept:

We can define the state of affairs in our own words as follows:

"The state is a group of people who have a specific territory or territory and have an organized government, which is recognized by all the people and organizations of that group and are free from all kinds of external pressure and power."⁽¹⁾

Praising the state, Widrow Wilson writes:

"The state refers to a group of people who are usually present in a part of the world, in which the opinion of the majority prevails over that of the minority."⁽²⁾

Similarly Shah Waliullah writes:

واعنى بالمدينة جماعة تقاربة تجرى بينهم المعاملات ويكونون اهل منازل شتى،والاصل فى ذلك ان المدينة شخص واحد من جهة ذلك الربط مركب من اجزاء وهيئة اجتماعية.⁽³⁾

‘‘Ahl al-Madinah (state) refers to those parties which are close to each other, they have mutual affairs and live in different places.’’

Similarly, the Islamic state is meant to be a high social institution in which the religion of all people And worldly affairs should be decided according to the laws given by Allah Almighty.

The need and importance of the state:

Man is inherently in need of a collective life, but in pursuit of his desires he engages in certain movements which threaten the deterioration of individual morals as well as disruption of social order. The state and government are responsible for protecting and delivering. The function of the state and government is to establish and maintain social relations, economic affairs, cultural conditions, and to be responsible for its protection and supervision. To create facilities for justice, education and health etc. and to be equipped with the things that are needed for the stability and security of the country as a whole. Maulana Muhammad Idrees, while stating the need and importance of the state, writes:

There are many people who are not free from selfishness and lust and selfishness and lust is the root of all tribulations and evils, which must be countered rationally and legally, because murder, bloodshed, theft, robbery and looting are all due to this selfishness and lust. We need to be able to protect the people of the country from mutual oppression and aggression and to give rights to the oppressed inside the country. To resist sedition’’⁽⁴⁾

Different systems of politics:

The systems of politics that have been well-known in the world till now can be divided into: ⁽¹⁾ Islamic system of politics ⁽²⁾ Monarch ⁽³⁾ Elite ⁽⁴⁾ Democracy ⁽⁵⁾ Communism etc.

1. Islamic system of politics and government:

An Islamic government is a government that is governed by Islamic law, that is, a government that calls itself a Muslim and declares its religion as Islam as a government, ie, recognizes that the government as a common government is the religion of Islam Do you think such a government is an Islamic government?

2. Kingdom:

Probably the most prevalent and influential political system in the history of the world is the monarchy system which has been in force in its various forms from the beginning till today and has been interfering in most parts of the history. But its forms have been different in different periods and in different countries, they have not remained the same, in other words there are many types of monarchies: such as absolute, council, religious and constitutional monarchy.

3. The system of the elite:

Elite is a coined word derived from aristocracy, aristocracy refers to noble people ie people who have a place of greatness in society, they are called aristocracy Rather, the right to govern is vested in a select few who possess certain lineage, or possess certain attributes which are called elite class, the elite class has the right to govern.

4. Democracy:

The word democracy is actually a translation of the English word Democracy, which is based on the idea that the people have the right to rule, hence the meaning of democracy is a system of government in which the opinion of the people is formed to formulate government policies in one form or another. ⁽⁵⁾

5. Socialism

Socialism in English, which is derived from society and its source is social, which means “social or sociological”. In political and economic terms, socialism is defined as: It is considered to liberate the individual from the worries of welfare and basic necessities of life. ⁽⁶⁾

Establishment of Islamic government:

There are many religions in the world which have nothing to do with politics, that is why politics and religion have always been separate for each other and even if there is consensus between the two, namely and temporary. Similarly, Islamic politics cannot be separated from the religion of Islam.

الإسلام والسلطان أخوان توأمان لا يصلح وَاِجْمَعْنَهِمَا إِلَّا بِصَاحِبِهِ فَالْإِسْلَامُ اسٌّ وَ السُّلْطَانُ حَارِثٌ وَمَا لَاسٌّ لَهُ يَهْدُمُ وَمَا لَ حَارِثٌ لَهُ ضَائِعٌ ⁽⁷⁾

Islam and the government and the state are twin brothers, neither can be right without the other, so the example of Islam is of a building and the government is like its guardian All schools of Islamic thought agree that the position of Imamate is necessary for the Nation of Islam. There is a consensus of the entire ummah on this issue. This is necessary and necessary in the eyes of all, because unless an Islamic society and Islamic state is established, Muslims cannot fulfill the requirements of their faith. Let there be an Islamic government and let all matters of life be settled according to the divine law, and before the migration to Madinah, Allah Almighty issued this prayer in the language of His Prophet ﷺ

وَقُلْ رَبِّ ادْخُلْنِي مَدْخَلَ صِدْقٍ وَأَخْرِجْنِي مَخْرَجَ صِدْقٍ وَاجْعَلْ لِي مِنْ لَدُنْكَ سُلْطَانًا نَصِيرًا ⁽⁸⁾

And pray that my Lord may take me wherever He takes me, and take me out of where He will take me well, and grant me dominion and help from Him.

That is to say, either give me power or help a government so that I can get rid of all the sins with its help. Therefore, in the eyes of the scholars, it is the duty of the Muslims to appoint their own emir according to the law of the world and to protect the honor of the Prophet ﷺ. The repression of the oppressed and the redressal of grievances and justice and the establishment of justice and protection of the borders is not possible without the emir, and the protection of the honor of Islam as the duty of the Muslims is a duty which is not possible without government and monarchy.

Islamic concept of the foundation of the state:

The concept of state and government as presented by Islam is based on the important and fundamental principle that the real sovereignty of this universe belongs to Allah and the rulers of the world can rule only under this sovereignty. This is the first and fundamental provision of The Holy Qur'an has clearly stated in different words:

ان الحكمَ لآلِ اللَّهِ⁽⁹⁾

This verse and other similar verses illustrate the fact that sovereignty in this universe belongs to Allah alone, whereas in secular democracy the right of sovereignty is recognized for the people. This right does not belong to anyone except Allah Almighty and if a person declares someone else to be the ruler in this sense, then he is in fact committing shirk.

The recognition of the sovereignty of God Almighty is the basis that separates the concept of Islam from politics from secular democracy. In secular democracy, as the representative of the people, the parliament is so independent that it can pass any law. If there is any restriction on the legislative powers of the Islamic Republic of India, it can be removed by amending the constitution at any time. Which is against any rule of Qur'an and Sunnah.⁽¹⁰⁾

Characteristics of the Islamic State:

An Islamic state has many characteristics, the most important of which are:

1. Principled and ideological state:

The first characteristic of the Islamic State is that it is a principled and ideological state, it is not based on race, nor on color, nor on language, nor on the homeland, nor is it based solely on the sharing of economic interests. And not just political affiliation. The real foundation of this state is that it is the bearer of Islamic ideology, its subject and its founder. The state that declares God's political sovereignty and enforces His law is the Islamic state. It is true that the Islamic State, like any other state, must have a definite territory and population and the protection of the land and the welfare of its inhabitants is before it at all times but the distinguishing feature of the Islamic State is that it is an ideological state.

In Islam, the law prevails over the government and the state and the government itself is bound by and subject to God's law. The state does not have total authority, but derives its authority from God's law. The loyalty of the state is as long as it is loyal to God and His Messenger and the divine commandments are enforced in this state. Such orders must be rejected. This is the comprehensive instruction of the Holy Prophet in this regard.

لَا طَاعَةَ لِلْمَخْلُوقِ فِي مَعْصِيَةِ الْخَالِقِ⁽¹¹⁾

There is no obedience to any creature in disobedience to the Creator. That is why the supreme authority of the Islamic state has been declared to be a Muslim. It is very wrong to expect a non-Muslim to enforce Islamic rules, because he is neither sincere to Islamic rules nor the progress of Islam. It is very important that Muslims obey only those Muslim rulers who issue rulings according to Islam.

2. Consultative and Democratic State:

The temperament of the Islamic State neither can appease dictatorship nor is hereditary monarchy, its temperament pure democracy and shura. The first foundation of Islamic democracy is human equality.

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنَّا خَلَقْنَاكُمْ مِنْ ذَكَرٍ وَأُنْثَىٰ وَجَعَلْنَاكُمْ شُعُوبًا وَقَبَائِلَ لِتَعَارَفُوا إِنَّ أَكْرَمَكُمْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ أَتَقْوَمُ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلِيمٌ خَبِيرٌ⁽¹²⁾

O people! We created you from a male and a female, and made you into nations and families that you may know one another. The most honorable of you in the sight of Allah is the one who is most pious. Allah is All-Knowing, All-Aware.

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "There is no superiority of Arabic over non-Arabic, non-Arabic over Arabic, white over black and black over white, except for piety."⁽¹³⁾

All are equal in the eyes of the law. Islam does not discriminate between ruler and ruler, ruler and ruler, law is the same for all. Once upon a time, an honorable woman was about to be sentenced to death for stealing. Some of the Companions made a recommendation to the Holy Prophet.

وَالَّذِي نَفْسُ مُحَمَّدٍ بِيَدِهِ لَوْ سَرَقَتْ فَاطِمَةُ بِنْتُ مُحَمَّدٍ لَقَطَعْتُ يَدَهَا⁽¹⁴⁾.

I swear by the caste in whose hand Muhammad's life is, if Fatima bint Muhammad had also stolen it, I would have cut off her hand

This is the standard of law and social equality that can be imagined. Your best imams and leaders are those whom you love and they love you and you bless them and they bless you and you are the worst guides among you whom you dislike and they dislike you and they curse you and you curse them.⁽¹⁵⁾

The third foundation of the Islamic democratic state is the shura, ie the trustees of the Muslims should decide all the affairs of the kingdom in the light of the advice of the Muslims in accordance with the commands of God and His Messenger. Allaah Himself says to His Prophet:

وَأَشْأَوْرَهُمْ فِي الْأَمْرِ⁽¹⁶⁾

And consult them in matters. "

And regarding the Awli al-Amr, he says:

وَأَمْرُهُمْ شُورَىٰ بَيْنَهُمْ⁽¹⁷⁾

In addition, whose every action is done with advice. "

The Holy Prophet (sws) has also informed the Muslims about the importance and necessity of shura through his words and deeds. It is narrated from Hazrat Ali (sws): He said, "I asked, 'O Messenger of Allah, if there is an incident between us about which no ruling has been revealed in the Qur'an or in any hadith, then what is your instruction

on such an incident?' Consult with devout and honest Shariah experts, do not take individual opinion. ”⁽¹⁸⁾

Similarly, it is narrated on the authority of Abu Huraira:

مَا رَأَيْتُ أَحَدًا أَكْثَرَ مَشُورَةً لِأَصْحَابِهِ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ⁽¹⁹⁾

“I have not seen a person who consults his companions more than the Messenger of Allah.”

The order of consultation is for every matter and its every destination, what is its form? It will be determined according to the circumstances of each age, but its spirit is to consult with those who are people of resolution and understanding, who have understanding and insight and who are trustworthy of the people, all the collective work of Muslims. No one should be complacent, as many people as possible should do no group work, all of them or their representatives should be involved in the consultation and the consultation should be free, impartial and sincere, if these things exist. The right of the shura is paid, no matter what form it may take.

3. Welfare Department:

The third characteristic of the Islamic State is that it is a welfare and servant state. In the eyes of Islam, the government's job is not only to maintain law, order, and national defense, but also to ensure that all its citizens, whether Muslim or non-Muslim, are provided with necessities, if Islamic. Wherever there is poverty, oppression and tyranny within the borders of the state, then eradicate it and dedicate all your energies to solve these human problems.

Islam instills in every person the spirit of economic struggle and invites him to earn a living from his hard work. There is an extraordinary emphasis in the Qur'an and Hadith on the provision of hard work and pure earning. Islam also allows individual property, but at the same time it has created the idea that this property is like a trust which has the right to spend only on the right and proper paths, and In addition to their own rights, God and His servants have a right to do so. Also pay for human rights⁽²⁰⁾

It is the responsibility of the Islamic State to provide for the needs of all those who are compelled or disabled, helpless or deprived of sustenance. The Prophet ﷺ said:

السلطان ولي من لا ولي له⁽²¹⁾

The government is every person who has no guardian. ”

In addition to the basic needs, this sponsorship also includes the fulfillment of other needs of the people. After the conquests of the Prophet's time, when the treasury began to receive a lot of wealth, the Holy Prophet announced that those who are in debt and die, their debts will be paid from the treasury of the Islamic State.

And he said:

انا اولى بالمؤمنين من انفسهم فمن توفى وعليه دين فعلى قضاة⁽²²⁾

Muslims are more attached to me than their own lives, so I will be responsible for repaying the debt of the debtor who dies.

Similarly, it is known from another narration that in addition to the debt, the Prophet ﷺ also declared the same in relation to other responsibilities left by the deceased, such as providing for the helpless family and children:

وَمَنْ تَرَكَ مَالًا فَلِإِٰلِهِ وَمَنْ تَرَكَ دَيْنًا أَوْضِياعاً فَأَلِي وَعَلِي⁽²³⁾

And whoever leaves wealth, then it is for his heirs;

The whole history of the Rightly Guided Caliphate bears witness to the fact that those who held the presidency of the Islamic State after the Holy Prophet were fully aware of these vast responsibilities, especially regarding the responsibility of public welfare. He used to say that if any animal dies of starvation within the limits of Dar-ul-Islam then I fear that I will have to answer to Allah for it.

وَالَّذِي بَعَثَ مُحَمَّدًا صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بِالْحَقِّ لَوْ أَنَّ جَمَلًا ضِياعاً بِشَطِّ الْفِرَاتِ لَخَشِيتُ أَنْ يَسْأَلَنِي اللَّهُ عَنْهُ.⁽²⁴⁾
I swear by the One who sent Muhammad (peace be upon him) as a true messenger, if a camel is killed unjustly by the river Euphrates, then I fear that Allah will ask me about it on the Day of Resurrection.

4. Teacher and caller state:

The fourth characteristic of the Islamic State is that it is not only responsible for economic sustenance, but also for the promotion of moral education and civilization. A study of the entire history of Muslims shows that:

- Education has always been given paramount importance and has been generously patronized by the government and the wealthy.
- In the system of education, the first importance was given to the sciences of religion and at the same time all the sciences which are necessary for the defense of religion and establishment of life were promoted.
- Education has always been free.
- Along with education, character building and moral training remained an integral part.

Then this state is not only satisfied with the education of its citizens, but also presents the message of Islam to the whole world through its words and deeds. The Qur'an says:

كُنْتُمْ خَيْرَ أُمَّةٍ أُخْرِجَتْ لِلنَّاسِ تَأْمُرُونَ بِالْمَعْرُوفِ وَتَنْهَوْنَ عَنِ الْمُنْكَرِ⁽²⁵⁾

You are the best nation created for those who enjoin what is right and forbid what is wrong.

In any case, the Islamic State is like a teacher, it has to arrange the education and training of all its citizens and also present the message of Islam to the world.

Islam, Communism and Democracy:

The following is an overview of the political system of Islam that differs from both communist dictatorship and Western-style democracy.

Communism and Islam:

- Communism is alien to religion and the Islamic state is bound by divine law.
- Communism does not recognize the permanent and separate personality of the individual and integrates it into the class, while the Islamic provides opportunities to strengthen and develop the personality of the individual, it negates the classes and all Equates human beings.
- The system of communism is dictatorial while the system of Islam is shura.
- From a communist point of view, a state has absolute power, so personal freedom is not born in it. In Islam, the powers of the state are limited and in the

event of disobedience to the ruler, Muslims are instructed to refrain from obeying him. Real guarantees.

- The Islamic government considers the natural laws of religion to be infallible for the betterment of human beings, while communism destroys religion, morality and eternal truths and does not establish them on modern foundations.
- Islamic government considers limited private²⁶ property to be legitimate, allows for adequate capital, establishes a national treasury for surplus capital, recognizes the participation of all, and the distribution of capital between capital and poverty. Maintains balance and equality. While private ownership is the biggest corruption in communism and is illegitimate, every capital and every product (every part of capital) is a collective country, all capital remains in the trust of the government and is accumulated in the communal treasury. For these reasons, the Islamic State is very different from the communist dictatorship.

Western Democracy and Islam:

Islamic State is also different from Western democracy for the following reasons.

- In Western democracies, the supreme authority is vested in man, and in the Islamic style of government, the supreme authority is vested in God Almighty and His law. The laws of democracy are changing day by day, on the contrary, the rules of Qur'an and Sunnah are infallible and unchangeable. In matters where the Qur'an and Hadith are silent, laws can be made keeping in view the teachings of Islam and its spirit.
- Islam does not like ambitious, mean-spirited and ambitious people of positions, but it wants positions of responsibility to be given to people who do not expect them, as well as moral attributes for officials and rulers. Also suggests, while democracy does not care about these things.
- Democracy has become associated with geographical nationality, while the Islamic state is a principled and ideological state and its message is universal.
- Religion is the basic law for the Islamic government. The Islamic government insists on making the religion of Islam the aspiration of all human beings for the common good, but also gives the right to freedom of belief to the followers of other religions. Democratic government has no official religion. Democratic government is neither religious nor hostile to religion. Every democracy gives its people full freedom of belief and action.
- The Islamic government is called Imamate, Khilafah and Emirate Shura. In this government, the will of God is real. The system of government, the law of government makes everything by itself and does not obey the command of God, the people can form the government and can change any system of government.

References

¹ Shaheen, Mohammad Ashraf Qaisarani, Economic and Political Teachings of Islam, Quetta, New College Publications, p. 231

² Khalid Alvi, The Social System of Islam, Lahore, Al-Faisal, 2009, p.276

- ³ Shah Waliullah, Hujjatullah al-Balghah, Karachi, Ancient Library, Chapter 103: 123
- ⁴ Maulana Muhammad Idrees Kandhalvi, Dastur-e-Islam, Lahore, Ottoman school, pp. 12-13
- ⁵ Taqi Usmani, Islam and Political Ideology, Karachi, Maktab Ma'arif, 2012, pp. 25-80.
- ⁶ Maula Nagohar Rehman, Islamic Politics, Mardan, Understanding the Qur'an, 1989, p. 85
- ⁷ Al-Hindi, Ala-ud-Din Ali Al-Muttaqi, Kinz Al-Amal Fi Sunan Al-Aqwal Wal Aafaal, Kitab Al-Emarat, Volume 6: Page 10
- ⁸ Al-Isra 17:80
- ⁹ Al-Anam 6:57
- ¹⁰ Taqi Usmani, Islam and Political Ideology, p. 173-176
- ¹¹ Kinz al-Amal al-Hindi, Kitab al-Khilafah ma al-Emarat, vol. 5, p. 792
- ¹² Al-Hujrat, 13:49
- ¹³ Muhammad ibn Sulayman al-Fasi, Plural of Benefits, Book of Rites
- ¹⁴ Bukhari, Muhammad Ibn Ismail, Al-Jami 'Al-Sahih, Chapter
- ¹⁵ Muslim Ibn Al-Hajjaj, Al-Jami 'Al-Sahih, Kitab Al-Emarat
- ¹⁶ Al-Imran 3:159
- ¹⁷ Shura 38:42
- ¹⁸ Kunz al-Amal al-Hindi, Kitab al-Khilafah ma al-Emarat, vol. 5, p. 812
- ¹⁹ Tirmidhi, Muhammad ibn Isa, Sunan, chapters of Jihad, Hadith 1714
- ²⁰ Khurshid Ahmad, Islamic Theory of Life, Karachi, Karachi University, 1981, p. 496
- ²¹ Tirmidhi, Muhammad ibn Isa, Sunan, chapters of Jihad, Hadith 1714
- ²² Abu Ubayd al-Qasim ibn Salam, Kitab al-Amwal, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr, 1979, p. 233
- ²³ Muslim Ibn Al-Hajjaj, Al-Jami 'Al-Sahih, Kitab Al-Emarat
- ²⁴ Ibn al-Athir, Abu al-Hasan Ali ibn Abi al-Karam, The Perfect in History, Beirut, Dar al-Fikr, vol. 3, p. 56
- ²⁵ Al-Imran 110: 3